

Discussion of 'Social Image, Organisational Values and Inclusion: Evidence from a Field Experiment'

Karmini Sharma
Assistant Professor, Economics
Imperial College London

Third Accelerating Growth for Women Entrepreneurs
Conference, 2025

Summary

- ▶ The paper studies the role of different business or organization features on inclusive decision making
- ▶ Lab-in-field setting: HR managers vote between two candidates in different rounds (one M and F candidate)
- ▶ Young Ethiopian entrepreneurs are judged on the basis of video submission of proposals

Summary

- ▶ The paper studies the role of different business or organization features on inclusive decision making
- ▶ Lab-in-field setting: HR managers vote between two candidates in different rounds (one M and F candidate)
- ▶ Young Ethiopian entrepreneurs are judged on the basis of video submission of proposals
- ▶ Key features
 - ▶ Organizational values: judges are reminded about organizational values related to gender inclusivity
 - ▶ Social Image: Judges are asked to justify their decision to other judges who assessed the same two candidates

Summary

- ▶ The paper studies the role of different business or organization features on inclusive decision making
- ▶ Lab-in-field setting: HR managers vote between two candidates in different rounds (one M and F candidate)
- ▶ Young Ethiopian entrepreneurs are judged on the basis of video submission of proposals
- ▶ Key features
 - ▶ Organizational values: judges are reminded about organizational values related to gender inclusivity
 - ▶ Social Image: Judges are asked to justify their decision to other judges who assessed the same two candidates
- ▶ Main results:
 - ▶ Overall no effect on the likelihood that a female candidate wins
 - ▶ Organizational values treatment increases likelihood of female entrepreneurs winning who were ranked high by experts.
 - ▶ Both treatments increase coordination and unanimity in judges decisions on female candidates

General thoughts

- ▶ Firm RCTs are hard! Authors used a creative and clever method to understand the role of organizational features on inclusive decision making using a lab-in-field
- ▶ Positive effect for high ability female entrepreneurs is policy relevant given backlash against EDI initiatives.
- ▶ Upcoming analysis on transcripts of judges discussions would be an interesting addition
- ▶ Using expert judges is particularly reassuring and cool+ validating results using the endogenous stratification method helps strengthen the paper!

Main thoughts: Treatment interventions

- ▶ *Social Image treatment*: Discussion on why it is a social image treatment
 - ▶ Is there enough repeated interaction between these HR managers/judges with each other?
 - ▶ Was justification necessary to invoke social image concerns?
 - ▶ Second order beliefs: Could they have anticipated more pro-male environment and hence thought that justifying for female candidates will be hard?

Main thoughts: Treatment interventions

- ▶ *Social Image treatment*: Discussion on why it is a social image treatment
 - ▶ Is there enough repeated interaction between these HR managers/judges with each other?
 - ▶ Was justification necessary to invoke social image concerns?
 - ▶ Second order beliefs: Could they have anticipated more pro-male environment and hence thought that justifying for female candidates will be hard?
- ▶ *Organizational values*: Could the treatment be giving negative information about women by mentioning that women are taking fewer loans and also smaller sized loans than men (lower ambition, lower drive?).

Other comments

- ▶ *Experiment Demand Effects*: Gender experiments hard for this key reason! But treatments are focusing on gender equality, and the profiles are one M, one F. Can this explain some of the null effects?.

Other comments

- ▶ *Experiment Demand Effects*: Gender experiments hard for this key reason! But treatments are focusing on gender equality, and the profiles are one M, one F. Can this explain some of the null effects?.
- ▶ *Generalizable*: How to generalize to settings where decisions by managers would have a repercussion for their own organization? What would have happened if their incentives were tied to entrepreneurs' actual performance?

Other comments

- ▶ *Experiment Demand Effects*: Gender experiments hard for this key reason! But treatments are focusing on gender equality, and the profiles are one M, one F. Can this explain some of the null effects?.
- ▶ *Generalizable*: How to generalize to settings where decisions by managers would have a repercussion for their own organization? What would have happened if their incentives were tied to entrepreneurs' actual performance?
- ▶ *Expert Judges*: Really cool idea. Are they different from actual judges in experience and so could the real judges be making mistakes?.

Other comments

- ▶ *Experiment Demand Effects*: Gender experiments hard for this key reason! But treatments are focusing on gender equality, and the profiles are one M, one F. Can this explain some of the null effects?.
- ▶ *Generalizable*: How to generalize to settings where decisions by managers would have a repercussion for their own organization? What would have happened if their incentives were tied to entrepreneurs' actual performance?
- ▶ *Expert Judges*: Really cool idea. Are they different from actual judges in experience and so could the real judges be making mistakes?.
- ▶ *Unanimity on female candidates*: If social image treatment increases unanimity on female candidates, then it should have increased female share in final wins?.

Other comments

- ▶ *Experiment Demand Effects*: Gender experiments hard for this key reason! But treatments are focusing on gender equality, and the profiles are one M, one F. Can this explain some of the null effects?.
- ▶ *Generalizable*: How to generalize to settings where decisions by managers would have a repercussion for their own organization? What would have happened if their incentives were tied to entrepreneurs' actual performance?
- ▶ *Expert Judges*: Really cool idea. Are they different from actual judges in experience and so could the real judges be making mistakes?.
- ▶ *Unanimity on female candidates*: If social image treatment increases unanimity on female candidates, then it should have increased female share in final wins?.